Perceived Managerial and Leadership Effectiveness within a Moroccan Higher Education Institution

Siham Lekchiri[a*], Barbara. A. W. Eversole[b], Robert G. Hamlin[c], and Cindy. Crowder[d]

[a]Western Carolina University, Cullowhee, NC, USA; [b]Indiana State University, Terre Haute, IN, USA; [c]University of Wolverhampton, Wolverhampton, UK; [d]Indiana State University, Terre Haute, IN, USA

The purpose of this research was to determine what behaviorally distinguishes effective and ineffective managers within a Moroccan Higher Education Institution (HEI). The Critical Incident Technique (CIT) was the methodology deployed to collect data from participants in terms of how they perceive managers as either effective or non-effective. The collected data (CIs) were subjected to content and thematic analysis that resulted in derived positive and negative behavioral statements. A total of 42 participants/informants were interviewed and revealed a total of 418 CIs, of which 189 were positive CIs and 229 were negative. The analysis revealed a total of 49 Behavioral Statements (BSs), of which 19 were positive and 30 were negative behavioral indicators. The findings of this investigation bring empirical evidence to understanding what and how managers are perceived as effective or ineffective in the Moroccan academic context, and therefore adds to the literature. The information obtained can also provide rich information/knowledge that can be used as a basis to address the behavioral developmental needs of managers in HEIs. This research adds value by following a replication study as the French and Hungarian HEIs, which both were based on single HEIs; moreover, this study is the first to be conducted in the Moroccan/North African region.

Keywords: perceived managerial/leadership effectiveness; Morocco; higher education; international HRD

Introduction

Organizations' effective management and leadership are essential to organizational success. In fact, various studies previously conducted have proven the nature of behavior displayed by managers and leaders have a direct impact on employees' performance, happiness and loyalty to their workplace (Barling, Weber, and Kelloway 1996; Caldwell and Canuto 2010; Dvir, Eden, Avolio, and Shamir 2002). Viewing this from a higher education standpoint,

---

* Corresponding author. Email: slekchiri@wcu.edu

Arsenault (2007) stated that 'universities are definitively not immune to this need for effective leadership as they face similar challenges as any other organization' (14).

The impact managers have on their employees' job related behaviors is recognized by the literature; in fact, various experimental studies revealed that employees that have positive perceptions of their managers' behaviors display a greater levels of job satisfaction and productivity, an increased level of loyalty to the organization and lower turnover (Abiodun, 2010). According to various consulting surveys on managerial behaviors, having a good manager/supervisor counts as one of the top factors resulting in motivated and committed personnel (Istiaque 2015). While it is imperative to identify and recognize the positive impact of having an effective manager, it remains theoretical if it cannot be used to identify the nature of behaviors that make up a good or bad manager.

While economic industries generate knowledge-based goods, the industry of higher education has an important impact in expediting the production and distribution of knowledge worldwide. Considering the high importance of knowledge in the process of development across countries, understanding the nature of managerial behaviors in Moroccan HEIs is necessary to ensure a successful cross-border education in the context of globalization (Varghese 2009). HEIs in several countries are undergoing substantial structural and managerial changes. Accordingly, reconnoitering the nature of managerial behaviors that are perceived as effective or ineffective by the various stakeholders in HEIs becomes vital to their long-lasting success. Choosing a single-case Moroccan HEI for this study, the purpose of this investigation was to identify how the Moroccan workforce perceives managerial behaviors either as effective or ineffective in the select HEI. Understanding the nature of managerial effectiveness in nations has become of paramount importance with globalization in order to prepare managers to be effective. Due to the lack of empirical evidence noted in the literature review, the findings of this study would enable us to understand what the Moroccan workforce within and across managerial levels in HEIs perceives as effective and ineffective managerial behaviors. These findings, therefore, add to the current literature of HEIs from European and Anglo countries.

Background of the Study and Statement of the Problem

This research intends to investigate the nature of perceived managerial behaviors in Moroccan HEIs. This study stems from a genuine need to understand the managerial characteristics that lie behind the success or failure of management in Moroccan HEIs, which are experiencing significant changes on how they are organized and managed (Vicente 2014); new educational reforms are being suggested, with the purpose to have a more balanced, coherent and effective organizational and academic management of educational institutions (Vicente 2014). Additionally, education is significantly important for Moroccans who are expecting higher standards for education in order to address the needs of the labor market with regard to social and economic affairs (Sawahel 2009). There is also a need for indigenous and more inductive research in other countries considering that most research conducted in this arena is derived from western constructs (Hamlin, Nassar and Wahba 2010). Therefore, the problem of this research

was to determine the kind of managerial behaviors that are perceived as effective and least effective/ineffective by peers, subordinates, collaborators, and team members in Moroccan HEIs.

Purpose Statement

The purpose of this investigation is to identify how the Moroccan workforce perceives managerial behaviors either as effective or ineffective in the select HEI. The conducted literature review suggested that there remains a lack of empirical knowledge regarding what behaviorally distinguishes effective managers from ineffective managers in Moroccan HEIs. Specifically, the existing managerial behaviors investigations are limited in their focus on the frequency of behaviors rather than investigating how these behaviors are classified as effective/ineffective (Shipper and White 1999; Yukl 2012). According to Hamlin, Patel, Ruiz, & Whitford (2012) (2012), 'most managerial work and behaviour studies from the 1950s through to the present day have been focused on the duration and frequency of activities and behaviours, as opposed to exploring how behaviours are related to measures of effectiveness and what behaviourally distinguishes good managers from poor/bad managers' (1). Thus, with globalization, it is pivotal to understand the nature of management effectiveness in nations and prepare managers to be more effective. Therefore, more empirical research is necessary to find out what the Moroccan workforce within and across managerial levels in HE perceive as effective and ineffective managerial behaviors. Further, this research seeks to provide insight on a concise understanding of the managerial behaviors concept in HE. The above-stated goal, with appropriate initiatives, should lead to an increased comprehension of the nature of managerial behavior to investigate managerial behavior in Moroccan HEIs.

Significance of the Study

The education sector is considered to be holding the responsibility of forming the future generations of any country; these latter will hold the future of the country and will be effective based on the quality of education they receive. Nonetheless, quality of education and management of educational institutions go together; it is therefore imperative that educational institutions' managers showcase exemplary behaviors (Hamlin and Patel 2015). Since a review of literature by the authors could not find any studies that identify and classify the nature of managerial behaviors in the education sector, a study was warranted. The need to conduct the current study comes from the fact that the Moroccan education sector has known an increased attention for future improvements; these changes cannot happen if a thorough investigation does not exist to understand the nature of management and its classification in Moroccan HEIs.

Education is also a sector of knowledge generation that heavily impacts employees' performance and productivity (Thomas and Feldman 2009). Any negatively perceived behaviors in the workplace will most likely affect the quality of employees' performance; therefore, in the light of the educational reforms undertaken by the Moroccan government as part of its development strategy of human capital empowerment (Zouhar, 2005), this study is warranted to understand what desirable behaviors positively impact performance, and what undesirable behaviors negatively impact employees in the HE sector.

Moreover, there is so little attention placed on studying the nature of managerial behaviors in HEIs in Morocco. This study is, therefore, expected to contribute to the higher education sector literature and advance recognition of managerial behaviors, which are considered to be indispensable for managers and employees' success within HEIs. The findings of this investigation can be used to continue the on-going reforms implemented by the Moroccan government to advance the education sector, the findings of this empirical study can also be used as best evidence by the collaborating Moroccan HEI and perhaps also other Moroccan HEIs, to inform the development of evidence-based HRD initiatives that would likely be more effective than conventional HRD programs.

Research questions

With the purpose of addressing the mentioned knowledge gap, this research raised the following questions:

(1) What managerial behaviors are perceived as being effective by Moroccan managers and non-managerial employees?
(2) What managerial behaviors are perceived as being least effective or ineffective by Moroccan managers and non-managerial employees?

Literature review

In this section, we discuss managerial effectiveness in the higher education sector, past managerial and leadership research, the national context in which the study occurred, and then outline the theoretical context that guided our study.

Managerial Effectiveness in Higher Education

The notion of managerial effectiveness has long been a subject of interest for both practitioners and scholars in the management field. The rising interest in this subject is due to the importance of understanding what makes managers effective or non-effective as perceived by their subordinates (Hamlin and Patel 2015). Managerial effectiveness according to Rudani (2013) is the extent to which managers accomplish the main requirements associated with their jobs. Hence, it is vital for organizations to have not only skilled and competent managers, but also effective ones that are able to accomplish the assigned goals effectively and efficiently with the proper individual managerial competencies (Prati, Douglas, Ferris, Ammeter, and Buckley 2003). In the context of the current study, effectiveness of managers is viewed not only on their performance but on how their behavior is perceived by their subordinates and peers. Hamlin defined an effective managerial performance as 'the behavior which you wish all managers would adopt if and when faced with a similar circumstance' (Hamlin 2004). In other words, the discussed effectiveness is related to abilities and intrinsic personality strengths of a manager (Prati et al. 2003).

Universities and colleges as HEIs are viewed as being very essential assets to countries, which have a direct impact on the countries national development by providing education to

shape the future generations (Baporikar 2014). Moreover, universally, education is considered to be the most powerful tool desired for maintainable human and country development (Hamlin and Patel 2015). It is, therefore, a practical instrument needed to promote any country's economic growth and intellectual abilities, making it possible for nations to unlock their potential for a promised future development.

The primary and secondary educations are considered to be the foundations for HE, which plays a pivotal role in building and enhancing the pupil's abilities to recognize the societal needs, and therefore equip them with the proper means to fulfill those needs. This is why a great importance is placed on the management of HEIs that will have to address the continuous improvement reforms occurring over the years; where effective management and leadership are directly related to the success or failure of any HEIs, which in turn determines the extent to which the future graduates are successful in the development of their country. Hence, it becomes very crucial for HEIs to be managed and led in a way that would support and boost the achievements of the institutions' missions and goals as well as those of the students.

HEIs across the world operate relatively in the same way, which involves academic teaching, research to advance in academia and public service. However, the way they are administered and managed may differ from one country to another; this is the case because HEIs exist to attend the educational needs of their respective societies, which makes HEIs management not so much liberated from societal influences. Effective management is therefore a crucial component for the operational success of HEIs; additionally, given the significant role HEIs have in forming future leaders, investigating managerial behaviors is important (Hamlin and Patel 2015). Over the past two decades, HEIs in various countries have undertaken significant changes in the way they are managed and structured to improve efficiency, effectiveness and quality (Bolden, Petrov and Gosling 2009). Universities were conventionally managed on a scholastic basis with leading academics making guidelines that were generally executed by administrative managers. Nevertheless, transformations propelled by numerous stakeholders meant that senior academics have progressively had to manage their activities in a more business-like fashion (Hamlin and Patel 2015).

With the consideration of the education sector as an important element in molding the future generations of any country's leaders (Hamlin and Patel 2015), demonstrating exemplary managerial/leadership behaviors in HEIs is therefore necessary and deemed vital, since unfavorable managerial behaviors deleteriously affect employees' fidelity and commitment (Hamlin and Patel 2015), it is pivotal to comprehend and minimize such behaviors in knowledge-intensive sectors.

It is important to note that throughout this investigation, the notion of managerial leaders is based on the functions of leading and managing, which will be used interchangeably within the selected HEI for this study; this is pertinent since managerial staff within these institutions are considered managerial leaders that are exerting leadership responsibilities along with their managerial ones; this is similar to the replication studies conducted by Hamlin (2004), which

followed the "grass roots" concept of leadership as acknowledged by Russ-Eft, Berrey, Hurson, and Brennan (1996).

Higher Education – The Moroccan Context

　　　Morocco is a North African Arab/Muslim country, which has a lot of shared values with the rest of the Arab world, including the religion, history, certain traditions and language (Abbas and Wahabi 1995). Nonetheless, Morocco remains different from other Arab countries in the Middle East and North African Region as it had been colonized by both France and Spain, which therefore resulted in Morocco embracing both the French and Spanish languages not only as part of the social aspect, but also in the business and educational aspects.

　　　Higher Education in Morocco began in the mid-nineteenth century; in fact, Morocco has the world's oldest university name Al Quaraouine in Fez (El Fasi 1962). Paradoxically, the country's HEIs have endured a series of impediments since the country earned its independence from France in 1956 (El Fasi 1962). The country has taken action and implemented various reforms to improve the HE sector; however, more work still needs to be done to improve HEIs in Morocco (MNEHEPTSR 2008). One of the reforms lies heavily on the management of universities and colleges; in fact, the Ministry of Higher Education in Morocco devoted a lot of resources and efforts to solve not only the academic problems of HEIs, but also the managerial issues that are regularly encountered that affect the quality of education (Dubosc and Kelo 2012; Vicente 2014). Additionally, there is compelling evidence within the literature on the nature of management displayed in Moroccan organizations in general (Abbass and Wahabi 1995), and while this knowledge is important, it still does not classify the managerial behaviors as either effective or ineffective, which is necessary especially in a time when the country is trying to improve its higher education quality.

　　　The Moroccan HE sector is made of public and private institutions. According to Driouchi (2006), the Moroccan HE system includes a total of 247 public schools and 203 private institutions. The distribution of public schools is shown below in Table 1; private schools are not all accredited by the government, and are mostly established in major Moroccan cities such as Casablanca, Rabat, Marrakech, Oujda…etc. (MENESFCRS 2005).

Table 1
Moroccan Public Schools Distribution (MENESFCRS 2005).

Public Schools Distribution
80 institutions associated with 14 universities
59 institutions unrelated to universities under the control of the Ministry of Higher Education.
35 training centers for elementary educators training
73 institutions of professional training for applicants who earned their high school degrees "Baccalaureate"

The Moroccan HE system was derived from the French educational system ever since the country gained its independence in 1956. However, in the rise of continuous development and improvement initiatives, the late King Hassan II called in 1996 for the modernization of various sectors in the country, including HE. This modernization is regulated by Law No 01-00 enacted in May 2000, when it comes to organizing, managing, planning and guiding the HE system in Morocco. This legislation is managed under the National Education and Training Charter (Ammor 2010). Statute No 01-00 supports the academic, managerial and financial autonomy of HEIs. Statute 01-00 is a grand effort toward the transformation of the education sector academically, economically, and managerially (Assad 2009). At the academic level, the reform initiated in 2003 consists of the modularization of HE degrees; while private schools are encouraged to seek accreditation to unite with the public institution in enhancing the quality of education. The financial aspect of the reform encourages HEIs to find other alternative means of financing. As far as the governance aspect of HE, the new reforms aim at giving HEIs more governance autonomy when it comes to pedagogy, management and budget; in addition, the strategic plans of management, rules and assessments between the institutions and the Ministry of Education were significantly fostered.

In his speech in 1999, the late King Hassan II announced his plan to implement the educational reforms in response to the various noticed dysfunctions in the Moroccan educational system. The main objectives of the reforms included a more balanced, coherent and effective organizational and academic management of educational institutions; HEIs have to be fully responsible for their roles and be completely autonomous in their decision making process in all aspects while still being aligned with the main objectives set by the Ministry of Education; and establish a national system of educational competition to encourage HEIs to make more efforts to enhance the quality of education. This applies not only to public institutions but also to private institutions that are independent of the Ministry (Vicente 2014). The reforms are not only meant to improve the quality of education, but also to speed the ongoing process to develop the Moroccan society and economy by preparing the future graduates to penetrate the job market, especially in a time of a rising competition, and lower the unemployment rate among the population (Vicente 2014).

Previous Studies on the Moroccan Manager

In the hopes to answer the research questions of this investigation, the focus of the literature review was to find out more about studies focused on Moroccan Managers' behavior. Nonetheless, the search revealed and confirmed the paucity of empirical evidence on the perceived managerial behaviors displayed by Moroccan managers in general and more specifically in HE. However, one study was conducted to identify the value system of Moroccan managers using the Values for Working Questionnaire developed by Flowers, Hughes, Myers, and Myers (1975). Led by Abbas and Wahabi (1995), the study aimed at unveiling the managerial value system of Moroccan managers that influenced their behaviors. Although this research didn't answer the questions of this inquiry, it still provided valuable evidence on the

managerial influences. Abbas and Wahabi (1995) used the VWQ initially suggested by Graves (1970). Graves (1970) stated that people in general develop and grow through successive phases of psychological existence that are illustrative of their personal values and lifestyles. The VWQ instrument provided the possibility to understand and predict managers' behaviors in their work environment, in addition to the validity and bias-free aspect of the instrument in cross-cultural studies (Abbas and Wahabi 1995). Based on Flowers et al. (1975), the VWQ output was categorized by two main frames: an outer-directed category of managers and an inner-directed category of managers; each of these categories has three associated values. According to Abbas and Wahabi (1995), an outer-directed manager is one that is able to adapt to various situations, in addition to favoring stable work settings and following already set plans. On the other hand, an inner-directed manager is one that takes control and wants things done his/her way, in addition to readiness to change the environment to suit personal needs. These values are described in Table 2 below.

Table 2
Classification of Managers' Behavioral Values based on VWQ by Graves (1970), reported by Abbas and Wahabi (1995, 90).

Outer-Directed Manager Values	**Inner-Directed Manager Values**
• Tribalistic: an obedient manager to rules and authority	• Egocentric: a self-centered manager that doesn't like to abide by the rules
• Conformist: a manager that follows the rules and likes structure.	• Manipulative: a controlling manager that can make changes to accomplish a desired end.
• Sociocentric: a manager with a high need of affiliation	• Existential: a manager that tolerates uncertainty and is able to deal with others with different values and views.

Abbas and Wahabi (1995) distributed a total of 600 VWQs to Moroccan managers in the four biggest cities in Morocco. A response rate was estimated at 39%. The study revealed that the Moroccan managers are more egocentric and existentialist; therefore, leaning more towards the inner-directed values with 55% of Moroccan managers falling in this category. A further investigation of the topic by the researchers attributed this percentage to various reasons, which included the economy and social divisions that make the country with a high percentage of poor, therefore, people are constantly struggling to enhance their standard of living at any cost resulting in existential values (Abbas and Wahabi 1995). The second reason explaining the Moroccan existential managerial value system is due to the Europeanization of the Moroccans after the colonial occupations; therefore, the majority of Moroccans opened up to the French individualistic and existentialist principles.

The study also revealed that egocentric managers were represented by the category of people who have long seniority in their jobs, explaining their egocentrism on their inability to

move forward, which is faced with aggressiveness. On the other hand, the manipulative type of managers were among the top management or among leaders with political power, this manipulative and controlling aspect was argued by Barakat (2007) who found that Moroccan privileged people have a tendency to lean more towards the materialistic gains. The remaining 45% of the study was represented differently by the outer-directed category of managers, where tribalistic managers were mostly found among the small private sector organizations; while the sociocentric managers were identified among the low-income class of the population (Abbas and Wahabi 1995).

While Abbas and Wahabi (1995) identified the value system of managers in Morocco, which could eventually help identify and classify their behaviors, it still does not answer the question of how managers' behaviors are perceived by their subordinates and peers. Furthermore, from a human resource perspective, Benson and Al Arkoubi (2006) stated that Morocco's proximity to Europe makes it 'a transitional nation, one deeply tied to African and Middle Eastern roots, but also open to Western influences' (273), adding that Moroccan business and management practices are gleaned from Western practices due to the increasing global business opportunities in the country, and the dire need to reposition it in the international scene. Nonetheless, despite the motivation to adopt modern business practices and philosophies, the degree to which Morocco has impartially embraced the Western practices remains equivocal and yet to determined (Benson and Al Arkoubi 2006).

Theoretical Context

This study has been led by the concept of multiple constituency model (MCM) and implicit leadership theory (ILT).

Multiple Constituency Model

Several studies have been conducted in understanding managerial/leadership effectiveness; however, according to Hamlin et al. (2012), several of these studies have focused on the frequency of the studied behaviors rather than how they are perceived as either effective/ineffective. Tsui (1990), therefore, suggested that distinctive conceptualization of managerial effectiveness is necessary and hence encouraged the use of the MC Model instead. According to Prilleltensky (2000), a constituency is outlined as a group of constituents/individuals that behave on their personal interests with some inter-reliance on the organization. Hence, with a framework that involves constituents' viewpoints, it is possible to determine the effectiveness of various aspects in the organization including management. The primary goal of using the MCM is to evaluate the effectiveness as it associates with the impacted group of constituents. According to Connolly, Conlon, and Deutsch (1980), 'the multiple constituency model treats organizations as systems generating differential assessments of effectiveness by different constituencies' (214). Therefore, effectiveness of various aspects can be attributed to the perception of the affected constituents. According to D'Aunno (1992) the MCM application was described as follows:

'An organization is effective to the extent that it at least minimally satisfies the interests of multiple constituencies associated with it. The common underlying assumption of multiple constituency approaches is that organizations depend on various groups for resources, and ultimately, for survival' (346).

In that regard, D'Aunno (1992) emphasizes that two primary elements have to exist for the MC approach to be accomplished; first the constituents have to be distinguished, and second, evaluating the satisfaction standards of the stakeholders. In addition, D'Aunno (1992) added that the MCM is pragmatic in its nature with flexible parameters, and allows the researchers to apply it to a wide variety of situations, in addition applicability to diverse groups of stakeholders.

By deploying the MCM, managers are being perceived as functioning inside social structures that are made of various/multiple constituents/stakeholders that are in direct contact with the managers, and have their own expectations that justify their perceptions. In other words, a manager or an organization is considered to be effective based on the extent to which they satisfy the expectations of their stakeholders considering the four above stated perspectives (Athanasiou, Tsamourtzis, and Kokolios 2006).

In the scope of this study, managerial/leadership behaviors are thought to be mostly subjective by the anticipated/wanted expectations of the constituent/stakeholder. These behavioral prospects identify the standards by which a manager/leader's behavior and performance are being adjudicated and perceived (Hamlin and Barnett 2011). This is referred to as reputational effectiveness (Tsui 1984); Tsui and Ashford (1994) suggested that the nature of managerial behaviors displayed by managers have reputational consequences, which are then classified as either effective or least effective/ineffective.

Implicit Leadership Theory

This study is also guided by the Implicit Leadership Theory, which focuses on the notion that employees have their personal assumptions/perceptions of what constitutes an effective or ineffective managerial/leadership behavior (Eden and Leviathan 2005). In other words, employees use their already pre-conceived assumptions as standards to evaluate the effectiveness of managers/leaders; therefore, managers/leaders' behavioral effectiveness is assessed by the extent to which they fit with the individual implicit theories they have about what constitutes an effective/ineffective behavior; it is hence a process that starts with social perception, that moves to causal judgments and social inference, and finally results with behavioral consequences (Shondrick and Lord 2010). ILT has been described as the 'evaluations people make about leaders and the cognitive processes underlying evaluations and perceptions of leadership' (House and Aditya 1997, 416). Various researchers conducted empirical studies, which disclosed that people have schematic implicit leadership that drives their prototypical managerial/leadership attributes assumed of a prospective leader (Borman, Walter, Ilgen, and Klimoski 2003; Lord and Emrich 2000).

ILT suggests the notion of Cognitive Prototypes, which are schemas of a cognitive classification process that people use to encrypt the received information. These schemas

represent input for people with already pre-established cognitive configurations against which the received data about the leaders/managers is compared. These schemas then affect people's subsequent perceptions about the stimuli, which involves either people or objects (Ajzen 2005). According to Schermerhorn, Uhl-Bien and Osborn (2012), a prototype represents the collection of the most commonly prominent descriptions of the person or object. Hence, prototypes offer a practical technique to summarize the main characteristics of a category. In the scope of this investigation, Lord and Emrich (2000) explained that individuals within organizations use the ILT to encrypt, analyze and recollect particular experiences and behaviors; thus, individuals within an organization exhibit ILT by completing the cognitive categorization process using prototypes. The recalled memories of what makes an effective and ineffective manager/leader usually fit the perception of the manager/leader prototype behavior. Hence, as stated by Ruiz, Wang, and Hamlin (2013), 'the better the fit between the behavior of perceived individual managers/leaders, and the internal leadership prototypes based on implicit theories held by the subordinates/followers, the more likely they will be judged as effective or ineffective' (137). However, it is important to note that followers' perception may very well be influenced by the organizational environment and by the national culture they belong to (Ruiz et al. 2013).

Method

For the current study, we conducted an indigenous research approach aligned with previous HEIs studies conducted by Eversole and Hamlin. This will enable us to conduct a consistent comparative analysis of the findings. The researchers presumed an 'interpretist-constructionist' epistemology for the research questions of the study. The studies conducted by Hamlin and colleagues, just like Tsui, also utilized the extant Multiple Constituency Model of organizational effectiveness and applied it to the study of 'managerial effectiveness' at the subunit level and therefore focused on researching managerial effectiveness among managerial and non-managerial staff in the higher education sectors in France and Hungary.

Sample of research participants

Our research design sought to collect critical incidents or concrete examples of effective/ineffective managerial behaviors from employees within a Moroccan HEI. Establishing contact with employees at the Moroccan organization was achieved by the lead author of this article, a native of Morocco. A total of 150 managerial and non-managerial employees were approached and invited to participate in the study. This research design sought to collect at least a total of 450 examples of effective and ineffective managerial behaviors from a select sample of 50 managers and non-managerial staff. The number of CIT informants took into account that some may have some contextual constraints, and therefore may be restricted to participating in the study; having all expected 50 informants would have been ideal, but it was reduced to 42; this number would be similar to the French study conducted by Hamlin and Patel (2015) which involved a total of 37 informants. Of the 42 interviewees, 10 were in managerial

positions of which 5 were males and 5 were females; and of the remaining 32 non-managerial positions, 13 were males and 19 were females.

Data collection

Parallel to the studies conducted by Hamlin, this investigation also relied on the Critical Incidents Technique (CIT) originally designed by Flanagan (1954) as the principal research method to collect the data. CIT allowed to collect actual illustrations of witnessed behaviors (effective and ineffective) demonstrated by managers; it therefore described and reported a situation, and an action that was deemed significant 'critical' in determining whether the outcome was effective or ineffective (Flanagan 1954).

According to Flanagan (1954), CIT represents:

'a set of procedures for collecting direct observations of human behavior in such a way as to facilitate their potential usefulness in solving practical problems and developing broad psychological principles. The critical incident technique outlines procedures for collecting observed incidents having special significance and meeting systematically defined criteria' (327).

Before starting the data collection, each informant was briefed on the purpose and procedure of the protocol; the informants were also informed about the benefits of this investigation and how it can be used to better the management style in their organization. The key words (effective, ineffective, critical incident, behavior) used in this investigation were explained. Each interview lasted between 60 to 90 minutes allowing enough time to collect the CI data. Adhering as closely as possible to the common CIT data collection and data analysis protocols used by the researchers of replication studies that have informed the research design of this study was important to ensure the functional, methodological and semantic equivalence required for the cross-case/cross-nation component of the present inquiry, and thereby ensuring the complete the credibility, dependability and trustworthiness of its findings. Three main questions were asked during the interview: (1) What was the background situation, circumstance or context that led up to the critical incident you have in mind? (2) What and in what way exactly did the subject (the manager you observed) do/say or not do/say that was either effective or ineffective? and (3) What was the specific result or outcome of the critical incident that you have described, and on reflection, why do you perceive/judge this to be an example of 'effective' or 'ineffective' managerial behavior/managerial performance?

Every informant was asked to remember and describe ideally a total of 10 examples of critical incidents related to managerial behaviors noted within the last 6 to 12 months. It would have been ideal if the informants recalled equally 5 CIs of effective behaviors and 5 CIs of ineffective behaviors; however, this wasn't the case and informants recalled an average of 9 CIs not equally balanced. Moreover, according to the CIT Protocol created by Hamlin, these CIs were recorded/noted within the last 6 to 12 months. The essence of these critical incidents was that they need to be related to behaviors demonstrated by managers in the organization. According to Torres, Ruiz, Hamlin, and Velez-Calle (2015) 'the CIs could be related either to

behaviors exhibited by managers above, at the same level or below them in the organizational hierarchy' (208). The description of the particular CI had to be accompanied by an explicit identification of the circumstance of the incident as well as the outcome that resulted from it. In order to ensure nothing got lost in translation and ensure accuracy of the transcribed data, the CIs were read back to the informants to confirm and re-confirm the data.

Data analysis

Once the data collection process was completed, all transcribed critical incidents were read back to each informant to confirm their answers had been properly recorded; this eventually ensured the interpreted meaning of the information given was indeed the transcribed meaning. According to Hamlin's model (2004), the data analysis process should be done in two stages of coding and categorization.

First-Level Open Coding: The first step was to complete an "Open Coding" procedure, a first level of coding at the semantic level; Open Coding is a content analysis that allowed to distinguish the units of meaning covered within each critical incident explained by the informant (Hamlin 2004). The purpose of this step was to synopsize the content of the collected managerial/leadership behaviors that were reported by the informants during the interviews; this method allowed to effectively identify and categorize the behaviors. This method of analysis indicates that the perceptions of effective/ineffective managerial behaviors are connected to each of the participants/informants who have had experience with the manager in question (Flick, Von Kardorff, and Steinke 2004). The open coding was also utilized at the semantic level in order to find confirmation of sameness and similarities or as the other replication studies name it congruence (Flick 2002). Sameness was noted throughout the analysis in case the behaviors described were referred in more than two CIs. The similarities were noted when the behaviors in the CIs were described in different wording but the meaning was similar. Finally, congruence was noted when there was existence of similarity and sameness in the content meaning of the behaviors described. Therefore, the derived CIs were organized and categorized based on the "concept" identified. The coded critical incidents were extricated based on the unit of meaning they belong to. Any collected CIs that were arbitrated as unclear/ambiguous as to the meaning of the behavior had to be discarded from use in the data analysis. In this study, no CIs were rejected and all were viable.

Second-Level Axial Coding: The second phase of coding is "Axial Coding," and was used to compare and contrast the units of meaning as they relate to similarity, sameness or congruence of meaning; determine the relationship between the noted concepts, and finally group the recorded critical incidents into labeled behavioral categories (Hamlin 2004). This level of coding was done as part of an inductive thematic analysis (Braun and Clark 2006), which aimed at looking at the main themes and patterns emerging from the data analysis. Clusters were therefore made when congruence of meaning was noted. The authors worked to define the clusters with content experts; each cluster had to contain between 3 and 18 critical incidents. The minimum of three CIs was to avoid the possibility that a derived BS could relate to the idiosyncratic manager within the single organization, and that the upper limit of 18 was to enable

the maximum number of discrete BSs being identified. With more than 18 CIs undergirding a BS, there is the great likeliness of it containing two or more 'sub-clusters' of CIs that could mean the existence of a greater number of discrete BSs (albeit with smaller numbers of constituent CIs). Any CIs that were rarely displayed were subject to elimination from the collected CIs pool if they were not frequently exhibited. Thematic Coding was continued at an upper level of abstraction with the purpose to engender a reduced number of core behavioral categories to identify the thematic domains (Hamlin 2004). The clusters were then subject to an additional analysis to derive the appropriate Behavioral Statements (BS)

Ensuring trustworthiness of the findings

To ensure the data collection and analysis conducted by this research was valid, reliable and trustworthy, the lead researcher was coached and mentored on the use of the CIT Protocol by both special experts. In order to ensure internal validity, reliability and consistency, the process of triangulation was deployed (Shenton 2004; Vicent 2014). Triangulation was ensured by having the researcher conduct the content and thematic analysis of the gathered CIs, the latter were cross-checked and went through an audit by content experts in order to find grounds for agreement regarding the examined CIs and concluded behavioral categories.

Findings

Following the analytical techniques employed by the authors, the current study generated a total of 418 usable CIs. Analysis of the 418 CIs obtained from the 42 informants was done in accordance with two stage data analysis as deployed by Hamlin (2004) from other replications. The data analysis allowed the authors to derive a total of 49 Behavioral Statements, of which 19 were positive/effective (denoted by P) managerial/leadership behaviors, and 30 were negative/least effective/ineffective (denoted by N) managerial/leadership behaviors. Tables 3 summarizes the content of the deduced positive and negative managerial/leadership behavioral statements; Table 4 summarizes the framework of deduced managerial and leadership behavioral criteria in the Moroccan HEIs context.

Table 3
Overview of Deduced Effective/Ineffective Behavioral Statements

Effective Behavioral Statements
P1. Manager keeps the department in order, is transparent and everyone knows what is expected of them (7 CIs)
P2. Manager exhibits exemplary behavior and is a role model to the staff to foster great team spirit and improve teamwork and performance (6 CIs)
P3. Manager uses supports and/or helps employees when needed (12 CIs)
P4. Manager uses positive support and fosters a collegial and collaborative work environment (6 CIs)
P5. Manager makes sure the staff have all the needed resources to do their jobs in addition to securing outside support/resources (17 CIs)

P6. Manager trusts employees by giving autonomy and empowering (18 CIs)

P7. Manager gives employees freedom to complete tasks (11 CIs)

P8. Manager defends employees from internal and external threats and pressures (11 CIs)

P9. Manager displays care and concern for the staff and actively supports their personal matters (11 CIs)

P10. Manager supports professional development, training and learning opportunities (9 CIs)

P11. Manager is actively engaged into helping employees achieve their career ambitions (9 CIs)

P12. Manager exhibits an open mind for new ideas and suggestions from others (6 CIs)

P13. Manager actively involves and trusts employees or those he/she believes important in projects (3 CIs)

P14. Manager is approachable and encourages a teamwork environment (7 CIs)

P15. Manager uses participative approach and involves employees in decision making and problem troubleshooting (13 CIs)

P16. Manager generally maintains a good, clear and timely communication with staff (14 CIs)

P17. Manager gives constructive feedback to staff to help enhance their performance (10 CIs)

P18. Manager recognizes, acknowledges, and thanks successful performance and outcomes (11 CIs)

P19. Manager exhibits fair treatment towards employees both morally and monetarily (8 CIs)

Ineffective Behavioral Statements

N1. Manager imposes decisions or makes decisions without involving employees (11 CIs)

N2. Manager ignores staff input or efforts for matters impacting the employees' jobs (16 CIs)

N3. Manager promotes an environment of non-collaboration and unhealthy competition (3 CIs)

N4. Manager does not want to empower or give autonomy to staff (3 CIs)

N5. Manager does not take time to investigate and address issues, he rather makes quick judgments (3 CIs)

N6. Manager by-passes and/or overrides the decisions of staff (3 CIs)

N7. Manager uses dictatorial management style to force decisions on staff (7 CIs)

N8. Manager does not keep promises made to staff (6 CIs)

N9. Manager is unfair, lacks transparency, takes sides, doesn't listen and discriminates against staff (15 CIs)

N10. Manager does not protect staff interests from internal/external threats (10 CIs)

N11. Manager ignores staff input and is inconsiderate (5 CIs)

N12. Manager fails to provide staff with necessary resources and support to do their jobs (8 CIs)

N13. Manager exhibits uncivil behavior and creates hostile work environment (17 CIs)

N14. Managers is not approachable, does not respect staff's opinions or feelings, and does not protect them (8 CIs)

N15. Manager slacks in managerial duties and does not process staff paperwork timely (14 CIs)

N16. Manager does not address issues reported by faculty and staff in a timely fashion (6 CIs)

N17. Manager does not keep the department organized and accepts poor performance (6 CIs)

N18. Manager keeps staff in the doubt (4 CIs)

N19. Manager ignores staff suggestions meant to improve performance (3 CIs)

N20. Manager does not give autonomy to staff and micromanages their work (6 CIs)

N21. Manager displays negative and closed-minded attitude towards employees and rejects their ideas (6 CIs)

N22. Manager does not fight or care for staff developmental and training needs (5 CIs)

N23. Manager does not care about the departmental needs (3 CIs)

N24. Manager provides negative derogatory feedback (5 CIs)

N25. Manager deprives staff of due recognition and acknowledgement (11 CIs)

N26. Manager takes credit for work done by employees and fails to recognize their work and efforts (10 CIs)

N27. Manager makes rushed decisions and fails to communicate timely and keep staff informed (17 CIs)

N28. Manager does not give employees positive, direct or constructive feedback on their performance (8 CIs)

N29. Manager fails to communicate clear objectives, expectations and agendas for meetings (6 CIs)

N30. Manager adds responsibilities to staff jobs without informing them or getting their consent (5 CIs)

This study findings are significant in identifying how the Moroccan workforce in one HEI perceives managers/leaders, and show strong convergence with how the French and Hungarian workforce in HEIs perceive managers/leaders. The noted degrees of sameness and similarity are prominent and challenge the prevailing assumption that managerial and leadership behaviors are culturally specific (Wendt, Euwema, and Emmerik 2009). This idea is consistent with the findings by Hamlin and colleagues. The select Moroccan HEI workforce perceives a manager as being effective when he/she exercises effective planning and proactive control, shows active supportive management/leadership, allows employees to have the autonomy and empowerment to grow professionally, displays care and concern for the staff's personal and professional needs (including learning and development needs), is open and trusting, gives the employees a voice to be involved in planning and problem solving, keeps the staff informed timely, recognizes their work and finally exercises fair treatment for everyone. Empowerment, support for personal and development needs and effective timely communication were rated as the most frequently derived effective managerial behaviors. Hence this study suggests that for a manager to be perceived as effective in the Moroccan HEIs context he/she would need to focus on displaying these top three behaviors at least.

On the other hand, regarding the more ineffective behavioral statements, managers generally are seen as ineffective if they behave in a manner that is autocratic and force decisions on employees without involving them, they are also considered ineffective if they ignore their staff input and finally, fail to acknowledge and recognize their staff's work; these top three BSs

were considered the most important based on the number of CIs collected with congruent meaning.

Based on the thematic analysis of the BSs, the study revealed a total 10 effective/positive behavioral criteria and 7 negative/ineffective behavioral criteria deduced from the Moroccan HEIs context. Table 4 summarizes the framework of deduced managerial and leadership behavioral criteria in the Moroccan HEIs context.

Table 4

Framework of Deduced Managerial and Leadership Behavioral Criteria in the Moroccan HEIs Context

Framework of Deduced Managerial and Leadership Behavioral Criteria in the Moroccan HEIs Context
Effective/ Positive Behavioral Criteria
1. Effective planning and organization and proactive execution and control
2. Active supportive management and managerial leadership
3. Delegation and empowerment
4. Care and concern for staff and others
5. Actively address the learning and development needs of the staff
6. Open, personal and trusting management approaches
7. Involves staff in planning, problem solving and decision making
8. Communicates and consults well with staff and keeps them informed
9. Recognition and acknowledgement
10. Treats employees fairly
Ineffective/ Negative Behavioral Criteria
1. Inappropriate autocratic and non-consultative management style
2. Unfair, inconsiderate, self-serving behavior
3. Undermining and intimidating behavior
4. Weak/slack management and tolerance of poor performance from others
5. Closed-mind and negative approach
6. Lack of recognition and acknowledgement
7. Poor managerial communication

Discussion & Conclusion

The education sector is considered to be holding the responsibility of forming the future generations of any country; hence, having a strong effect on the quality of education delivered in HEIs; and it is necessary that higher education institutions are fully prepared to showcase exemplary managerial behaviors (Hamlin and Patel 2015). The literature review conducted for this research revealed a paucity of empirical evidence on what classifies the nature of managerial behaviors in the Moroccan HEIs sector, and therefore, a study was warranted. Particularly, the previously conducted managerial behavior studies have a limited focus on the frequency of

behaviors rather than researching how the displayed behaviors are categorized as effective or least effective/ineffective (Yukl 2012). This goes in line with the remarks made by Hamlin et al. (2012), that the majority of managerial work and behavioral studies to this day have only focused on how frequent behaviors are instead of investigating how the behaviors are associated with measures of effectiveness and what behaviorally differentiates good and bad/poor managers. Additionally, the importance of carrying out this study was driven by the fact that the Moroccan HEIs field is also undergoing radical changes driven by continuous improvements initiatives; thus, these improvements cannot occur without systematic research to better understand the nature of management and its classification in Moroccan HEIs. Also, according to Thomas and Feldman (2009), negatively perceived managerial behaviors most likely affect employees' performance and productivity, which drives the need to better understand what desirable behaviors positively impact performance, and what undesirable behaviors negatively impact the Moroccan HEIs sector. The current investigation has added and provided empirical evidence to the literature and advanced understanding of managerial behaviors, which are considered to be essential for managers and employees' success within HEIs. Thus, the outcome of this study can be used to continue the on-going reforms implemented by the Moroccan government to advance the education sector. From a theoretical standpoint, the findings of this investigation could be an addition to the already conducted empirical studies in select European countries in order to deepen understanding of the differently perceived managerial behaviors in various countries, finding the points of convergence and divergence.

From a theoretical standpoint, the findings therefore challenge a number of assumptions that effective and ineffective managerial effectiveness is culture-specific. In fact, according to Hamlin and Eversole's French and Hungarian HEIs studies, high degrees of sameness and congruence support the assumption that these behaviors are not culturally or contextually specific. Undeniably, the findings of the current study and various similar studies in other industries, Hamlin et al. (2012) 'suggests the behavioural determinants of perceived managerial and leadership effectiveness are far more "universalistic" than has previously been reported in the literature' (255).

Implications for HRD Practice and Research

The nature of this study, as far as the universalistic and contextual aspects of managerial/leadership effectiveness, has already been covered in various nations by Hamlin and colleagues, and therefore have provided a solid theoretical foundation. Hamlin and colleagues asserted there is a rising 'dependency on managerial/leadership skill, competence and effectiveness within HEIs in most countries' (Hamlin and Patel 2015, 17). In addition, Hamlin et al. (2015) reported from Hempsall (2014) that 'leadership in HE is not yet demonstrating the level of readiness or capability to respond effectively to the challenges embodied in the transition to the knowledge era' (384).

Regarding the practical application, the findings can be used to enlighten the understanding on what constitutes effective and ineffective managers as perceived by

stakeholders in the Moroccan HEIs context, and therefore establish a framework on best managerial/leadership practices. It's also advised to use the findings to address the deduced perceived managerial inefficiencies by offering HRD programs. Therefore, as previously noted by Hamlin and colleagues, there needs to be more research and HRD programs to better understand and address the knowledge and learning needs of managers/leaders in academic settings. Hamlin et al. (2015) also argue that HRD programs lack the practical aspect in the real life due to these programs being 'insufficiently evidence-based in their delivery of Learning and Management Development programmes, and consequently fail to convince managers as to the causal link between certain types of managerial behaviour and effective versus ineffective outcomes' (17), adding that this is mainly due to the lack of evidence-based delivery of HRD program contents in academia, which therefore results in a failure to persuade managers as to the connection between managerial behaviors and performance/outcomes (good and bad). In order to resolve these paucities, it is recommended that practitioners and researchers utilize the data generated from the behavioral indicators studies as to what constitutes managerial/leadership effectiveness, which are based on pragmatic investigations, and use that data as evidence in the Moroccan HEIs and other similar contexts to advise on the use of HRD programs based on empirical evidence. Finally, the findings of this investigation could be an addition to the already conducted empirical studies in select European countries in order to deepen understanding of differently perceived managerial behaviors in various countries, finding the points of convergence and divergence. Based on the analysis of the findings, there is a high degree of sameness and congruence, therefore supporting the assumption that these behaviors are not culturally or contextually specific.

Limitations & Recommendations

This research generated much needed knowledge to the topic of managerial behaviors in the Moroccan HEIs sector, given the lack of empirical evidence encountered during the literature review. Nonetheless, the perception of managerial behaviors remains a difficult area to investigate, especially in a country like Morocco, where employees fear their perceptions of their managers might impact their work stability. Therefore, a number of limitations were expected and encountered.

The first limitation was related to the scope of the study which included a single university case, the findings could only apply to a limited population of the HEIs workforce; thus, the findings cannot be generalized to all Moroccan HEIs. A second limitation was related to the participants' sample, which contained a somewhat higher share of females (n=24) compared to the males (n=18); hence, gender may have impacted the findings. A third limitation was related to the strict code of anonymity during the data collection process, which ensured that informants didn't reveal the manager/superior of their self-reported perceptions. Therefore, this research does not necessarily provide a multi-directional all-inclusive comprehension of managerial/leadership effectiveness within the Moroccan HEIs context, nonetheless, it guarantees a one-sided evenly hierarchical view of a single standpoint. Also, considering the nature of the data collected, which was primarily based on self-reported perceptions, some data

might be biased and subjective. Finally, although a total CI count of 418 is considered to be robust, a count of 500 would have been an even better indicator of data saturation. It is possible that some perceptions may have been missed in this case.

Considering the stated limitations, it's recommended that additional replication studies in Moroccan HEIs as well as in other countries are conducted using the CIT Protocol, this will ensure a more thorough analysis is done to better understand the perceptions of managerial behaviors in various settings; the findings will either confirm the congruence or challenge the differences in findings. Cross-case studies would also aid in providing more empirical evidence on the topic, thus resulting in a nation specific and global framework of perceived managerial and leadership effectiveness.

References

Abiodun, Raimi-Akinleye. 2010. *Leadership Behavior Impact on Employee's Loyalty, Engagement and Organizational Performance: Leadership Behavior and Employee Perception of the Organization*. Bloomington, IN: AuthorHouse.

Abbas, Ali. J., and Wahabi, Rachid. 1995. "Managerial Value Systems in Morocco." *International Studies of Management & Organization* 25 (3): 87-96. doi:10.1080/00208825.1995.11656661.

Ajzen, I. 2005. *Attitudes, Personality and Behaviour 2nd ed.* Maidenhead: Open University Press.

Ammor, Fouad M. 2010. "Higher Education in Morocco." *European Commission TEMPUS*. Accessed January 1, 2016. http://eacea.ec.europa.eu/tempus/participating_countries/overview/morocco_tempus_country_fiche_final.pdf

Arsenault, P. M. 2007. "A Case Study of a University Leadership Seminar." *Journal of Leadership Education* 6: 14-24.

Assad, Redouane. 2009. "Financing Access and Equity in Higher Education: Challenges for Higher Education in Morocco." *Global Perspectives on Higher Education*. Accessed December 4, 2015. https://www.sensepublishers.com/media/403-financing-access-and-equity-in-higher-education.pdf

Athanasiou, N., Tsamourtzis E., and Kokolios, F. 2006. "Organizational Effectiveness of the Developmental Program of the Hellenic Basketball Federation." *Current Developments in Technology-Assisted Education.* Accessed December 1, 2015. http://www.formatex.org/micte2006/CoverTOC1.pdf

Barakat, Halim. 2007. *The Arab World: Society, Culture, and State*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Barling, J., Weber, J., and Kelloway, E. K. 1996. "Effects of Transformational Leadership Training on Attitudinal and Financial Outcomes: A Field Experiment." *Journal of Applied Psychology* 81: 827-832.

Baporikar, Neeta. 2014. *Handbook of Research on Higher Education in the MENA Region: Policy and Practice.* Hershey, PA: IGA Global Publishing.

Benson, G. P., and Al Arkoubi, K. 2006. "Human Resource Management in Morocco." In *Managing Human Resources in the Middle East,* edited by P. S. Budhwar & K. Mellahi. 273–290. London & New York: Routledge.

Bolden, R., G. Petrov, and J. Gosling. 2009. "Distributed Leadership in Higher Education: Rhetoric and Reality." *Educational Management Administration & Leadership* 37 (2): 257–77.

Borman, Walter C., Daniel R. Ilgen, and Richard J. Klimoski. 2003. *Handbook of Psychology: Industrial and Organizational Psychology*. Estados Unidos: John Wiley & Sons.

Braun, V., and Clarke, V. 2006. "Using Thematic Analysis in Psychology." *Qualitative Research in Psychology* 3 (2), 77–101.

Caldwell, C., and Canuto C, M. 2010. "Organizational Terrorism and Moral Choices Exercising Voice When the Leader is the Problem." *Journal of Business Ethics* 97(1): 159-171.

Connolly, T., Edward J. Conlon, and S. J. Deutsch. 1980. "Organizational Effectiveness: A Multiple-Constituency Approach." *The Academy of Management Review* 5 (2): 211-217. doi:10.2307/257430.

D'Aunno, Thomas. 1992. "The Effectiveness of Human Service Organizations: A Comparison of Models." In *Human Services as Complex Organizations*, edited by Yeheskel Hasenfeld. 341-61. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

Driouchi, Ahmed. 2006. "A Global Guide to Management Education 2006." *Global Foundation for Management Education*. http://www.gfmeglobal.org/global_guide/pdf/133-138%20Morocco.pdf.

Dubosc, Flora, and Kelo, Maria. 2012. "Human Resource Management in Public Higher Education in the Tempus Partner Countries*." European Union Tempus* 10: 3-181.

Dvir, T., Eden, D., Avolio, B., and Shamir, B. 2002. "Impact of Transformational Leadership on Follower Development and Performance: A Field Experiment." *Academy of Management Journal* 45: 735-744.

Eden, D., and Leviathan, U. 2005. "From Implicit Personality Theory to Implicit Leadership Theory: A Side-trip on the Way to Implicit Organization Theory." In *the Leadership Horizon Series: Implicit Leadership Theories-Essays and Explorations,* edited by B. Schyns & J. R. Meindl. 3–14. Greenwich, CT: Information Age Publishing.

El Fasi, Mohammed. 1962. "L'Université Marocaine au Tournant de son Histoire." *Le Monde diplomatique*. Accessed December 4, 2015. https://www.monde-diplomatique.fr/1962/06/EL_FASI/24778.

Eversole, B. A. W., Hamlin, R. G., Juhász, M., Belá, A., and Répáczki, R. 2016. "Perceived Effective and Ineffective Managerial Behaviors in the Hungarian Higher Education Sector. *Proceedings from the 2016 University Forum for Human Resource Development Conference.* Manchester, England: UFHRD.

Flanagan, J. C. 1954. "The Critical Incident Technique." *Psychological Bulletin* 51 (4): 327-58. doi:10.1037/h0061470.

Flick, U. 2002. *An Introduction to Qualitative Research*. London: Sage Publications.

Flick, U., E. V. Kardorff, and I. Steinke. 2004. *A Companion to Qualitative Research*. London: Sage.

Flowers, Vincent S., Hughes, Charles L., Myers, M. Scott and Myers, Susan S. 1975. *Managerial Values for Working, an AMA Survey Report*. New York: American Management Association.

Graves, C. W. 1970. "Levels of Existence: An Open System Theory of Values." *Journal of Humanistic Psychology* 10 (2): 131-55. doi:10.1177/002216787001000205.

Hamlin, R. G. 2004. "In support of Universalistic Models of Managerial and Leadership Effectiveness." *Human Resource Development Quarterly* 15 (2): 189-215.

Hamlin R. G., and Barnett, C. 2011. "In Support of an Emergent General Taxonomy of Perceived Managerial and Leadership Effectiveness: An Empirical Study from the UK Independent Schools Sector." *Paper presented at the UFHRD/AHRD 12th International Conference on HRD Research and Practice across Europe.* University of Gloucestershire, United Kingdom.

Hamlin, R. G., Nassar, M., and Wahba, K. 2010. "Behavioural Criteria of Managerial and Leadership Effectiveness within Egyptian and British Public Sector Hospitals: An Empirical Case Study and Multi-Case/Cross-Nation Comparative Analysis." *Human Resource Development International* 13 (1): 45-64.

Hamlin, R. G., and Patel, T. 2015. "Perceived Managerial and Leadership Effectiveness within Higher Education in France." *Studies in Higher Education* 42 (2): 292- 314. doi:10.1080/03075079.2015.1045480.

Hamlin, R. G., Patel, T., Ruiz, C. E. and Whitford, S. 2012. "Towards a Universal Taxonomy of Perceived Managerial and Leadership Effectiveness: A Multiple Cross-Case/Cross-Nation Study of Effective and Ineffective Managerial Behaviours." *Proceedings of the 13th UFHRD International Conference of Human Resource Development Research and Practice across Europe,* Universidade Lusiada de Vila Nova de Famalicao, Portugal.

Hempsall, K. 2014. "Developing Leadership in Higher Education: Perspectives from the USA, the UK and Australia." *Journal of Higher Education Policy and Management* 36 (4): 383-94. doi:10.1080/1360080x.2014.916468.

House, R. J., and Aditya, Ram N. 1997. "The Social Scientific Study of Leadership: Quo-Vadis?" *Journal of Management* 23 (3): 409-73. doi:10.1016/s0149-2063(97)90037-4.

Istiaque, Hossein Molla. 2015. "Ensuring Job Satisfaction for Managing People at Work." *Global Disclosure of Economics and Business Psychology* 7 (12): 155-165.

Lord, R. G., and Emrich, C. G. 2000. "Thinking Outside the Box by Looking Inside the Box." *The Leadership Quarterly* 11 (4): 551-79. doi:10.1016/s1048-9843(00)00060-6.

Ministère de l'Education Nationale, de l'Enseignement Supérieur, de la Formation des Cadres et de la Recherche Scientifique. 2005. *Informations pour l'appréciation de l'ampleur de la demande potentielle en credits d'études*. Summary Report. MENESFCRS.

Ministry of National Education, Higher Education, the Professional Training and Scientific Research (MNEHEPTSR). 2008. *To breathe new reform: Introduction Emergency Programme 2009-2012, Summary Report*. Report. Ministry of National Education, Higher Education, the Professional Training and Scientific Research.

Prati, Melita L., Douglas, Ceasar, Ferris, Gerald F, Ammeter, Anthony P., and Buckley, Ronald M. 2003. "Emotional Intelligence, Leadership Effectiveness, and Team Outcomes." *International Journal of Organizational Analysis* 11 (1): 21-41.

Prilleltensky, Isaac. 2000. "Value-Based Leadership in Organizations: Balancing Values, Interests, and Power Among Citizens, Workers, and Leaders." *Ethics and Behavior Journal* 10 (2), 139–158.

Rudani, Ramesh. B. 2013. *Principles of Management*. India: McGraw Hill Education.

Ruiz, C. E., Wang, J., and Hamlin, R. G. 2013. "What Makes Managers Effective in Mexico?" *Leadership & Organization Development Journal* 34 (2): 130-146.

Russ-Eft, Darlene P., Caryl, Berry, Kathleen, Hurson, and Karen, Brennan. 1996. *An Essay from Zenger Miller: Updating the Meaning of Leadership: A Grass-Roots Model for the New Workplace*. San Jose, CA: Zenger Miller.

Sawahel, Wagdy. 2009. "Morocco: Problems Remain Despite Reforms - University World News." *University World News*. http://www.universityworldnews.com/article.php?story=2009051514401160.

Schermerhorn, John R., Uhl-Bien, Mary, and Osborn, R. N. 2012. *Organizational Behavior 12th Ed*. New Jersey: Wiley.

Shenton, A. K. 2004. "Strategies for Ensuring Trustworthiness in Qualitative Research Projects." *Education for Information* 22: 63-75.

Shipper, Frank, and White, Charles S. 1999. "Mastery Frequency, and Interaction of Managerial Behaviors Relative to Subunit Effectiveness." *Human Relations* 52 (1): 49-66. doi:10.1177/001872679905200104.

Shondrick, S. J., and Lord, R. G. 2010. "Implicit Leadership and Followership Theories: Dynamic Structures for Leadership Perceptions, Memory and Leader-Follower Processes." In *International Review of Industrial and Organizational Psychology,* edited by G. P. Hodgkinson & J. Kevin ford. 3–14. Chichester: John Wiley.

Thomas, W. H. NG, and Feldman, C. Daniel. 2009. "How Badly Does Education Contribute to Job Performance." *Personnel Psychology* 62: 89-134.

Torres, L. E., Ruiz, C. E., Hamlin, R. G., and Velez-Calle, A. 2015. "Perceived Managerial and Leadership Effectiveness in Columbia." *European Journal of Training and Development* 39 (3): 203-219.

Tsui, A. S. 1984. "A Multiple-Constituency Framework of Managerial Reputational Effectiveness." In Hunt, J., Hosking, D., Schriesheim, C. and Stewart, R. (Eds.), *Leaders and Managers: International Perspectives on Managerial Behavior and Leadership*: 28-44, New York: Pergamon Press.

Tsui, A. S. 1990. "A Multiple-Constituency Model of Effectiveness: An Empirical Examination at the Human Resource Subunit Level." *Administrative Science Quarterly* 35 (3): 458-483. doi:10.2307/2393313.

Tsui, A. S., and Ashford, S. 1994. "Adaptive Self-Regulation: A Process View of Managerial Effectiveness." *Journal of Management* 20 (1): 93-121. doi:10.1177/014920639402000105.

Varghese, N.V. 2009. "Cross-Border Higher Education and National Systems of Education." *Education Across Borders* 33-48. doi:10.1007/978-1-4020-9411-8_3.

Vicent N. A. 2014. "Ensuring the Quality of the Findings of Qualitative Research: Looking at Trustworthiness Criteria." *Journal of Emerging Trends in Educational Research and Policy Studies* 5(2): 272-281.

Vicente, Llorent-Bedmar. 2014. "Educational Reforms in Morocco: Evolution and Current Status." *International Education Studies* 7 (12). doi:10.5539/ies.v7n12p95.

Wendt, H., Martin C. Euwema, and I. J. Hetty Van Emmerik. 2009. "Leadership and Team Cohesiveness Across Cultures. *The Leadership Quarterly* 20 (3): 358-70. doi:10.1016/j.leaqua.2009.03.005.

Yukl, Gary. 2012. "Effective Leadership Behavior: What We Know and What Questions Need More Attention." *Academy of Management Perspectives* 26 (4): 66-85. doi:10.5465/amp.2012.0088.

Zouhar, Y. 2005. *Human Capital and Economic Growth in Morocco*. Rabat: Ministry of Finance.